The Place of Protest in Ethical Citizenship

Colin Wayne Leach

Psychology & Africana Studies, Barnard College Psychology, Faculty of Arts & Sciences Institute for Research in African-American Studies Data Science Institute Zuckerman Mind Brain Behavior Institute COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY IN THE CITY OF NEW YORK



Student protesters resume demonstrations on Friday at Columbia University on 19 April 2024. Photograph: Anadolu/Getty Images

5th University of Maastricht Symposium on Global Citizenship Education Transformative Engagement

Protest more frequent than any time in modern history

(Brennan et al., 2020; Castells, 2012; Chenoweth, 2020).

Some of the largest protests recorded have occurred since 2000 (Ortiz et al., 2022):

- 100 million (in 2013) and 250 million (in 2020) Indian workers have held strikes
- 45 million (in 2019) and 11 million (in 2015) Brazilians have protested a political leader and their policies
- 15 million (in 2012) and 14 million (in 2011) in Egypt protested their political leaders

D Reported Rates of Increasingly involved Political Actions,

World Values Survey 7, 2017-2022 (>150,000 people in 80 countries on 6 continents).



Leach, C.W., Ferguson, S., & Teixeira, C.P. (in press) Protest now: A systems view of 21st century movements. Group Processes & Intergroup Relations.



Global Demonstrations in Response to the Israel-Palestine Conflict





"...arrest of >100 students at Columbia U on 18 April led to new wave of demonstrations in 36 states..."



BLM Protest after Killing of George Floyd

~8,700 demonstrations in 74 countries

[Armed Conflict Location & Event Data Project (ACLED) 2021]



(24 May - 22 August 2020)

Leach, C.W. & Teixeira, C.P. (2022). Understanding Sentiment Toward "Black Lives Matter". Social Issues and Policy Review, 16(1), 3-32.

BLM Protest after Killing of George Floyd

>11,000 Demonstrations in >3,000 locations

[Armed Conflict Location & Event Data Project (ACLED) 2021]

(1 January 2020 - 30 April 2021)



Leach, C.W. & Teixeira, C.P. (2022). Understanding Sentiment Toward "Black Lives Matter". Social Issues and Policy Review, 16(1), 3-32.

10 years of #blacklivesmatter on Twitter (daily volumes)



Leach, C.W. & Teixeira, C.P. (2022). Understanding Sentiment Toward "Black Lives Matter". Social Issues and Policy Review, 16 (1), 3-32.



Leach, C.W. & Teixeira, C.P. (2022). Understanding Sentiment Toward "Black Lives Matter". Social Issues and Policy Review, 16(1), 3-32.

Do you support or oppose the Black Lives Matter movement?

Registered Voters

Multiple Methods of Study

Small-scale Experiments (w/ photo stimuli)







- Reinka, M.A. & Leach, C.W. (2018). Racialized images: Tracing appraisals of police force and protest. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 115, 763-787.
- Reinka, M.A. & Leach, C.W. (2017). Race and reactions to police violence and protest against it. *Journal* of Social Issues, 73, 768-788.

"Big Data" Analyses of News Media (2014, 2020)

Ferguson, Missouri Community Furious After Teen Shot Dead By Police



BLM protesters clash with NYPD after marching onto George Washington Bridge



Riddle, T. A., Turetsky, K. M., Bottesini, J., Leach, C.W. (2020). "What's Going On" in Ferguson? Online News Frames of Protest at the Police Killing of Michael Brown. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*, 23, 882-901.
Turateky, K. M., & Piddla, T. A. (2018). Paragas

Turetsky, K. M., & Riddle, T. A., (2018). Porous Chambers, Echoes of Valence and Stereotypes. Social Psychological and Personality Science, 9(2) 163-175.

"Big Data" Analyses of Social Media (i.e., Twitter 2013, 2014, 2020)





06 PM - 9 Aug 2014 730 Retweets 1,207 Likes 💿 <table-cell> 🕸 🐨 📽 🌚 <table-cell> 🧐 😜 😵





Leach, C.W., Ferguson, S., & Teixeira, C.P. (in press) Protest now: A systems view of 21st century movements. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*.

Study Participants

167 University Students

- o 85 Black, 82 White
- o 107 women, 59 men, 1 trans man
 - Good EEG data = 119
 - 52 Black, 67 White
 - 70 women, 48 men, 1 trans man
- **Age**: 18-34
 - M = **19.4**, SD = 2.25

O **Political orientation** ["extremely liberal" (1) to "extremely conservative" (7)]

- M = 3.5, SD = 1.14
 - Black Ps = 3.10, SD = .96
 d = .658, p < .001; η_p = .33*

- White Ps = 3.85, SD = 1.17

• Awareness of Black victims (in the media). ["not at all"(0) to "extremely" (5)]

- M = 1.62, SD = .98
 - Black Ps = 2.20, SD = .99
 - White Ps = 1.18, SD = .71

Reinka, M.A. & Leach, C.W. (2018). Racialized images: Tracing appraisals of police force and protest. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *115*, 763-787.





Study Design

1,000ms ITI: 1000-1500ms (with jitter)





(30) Police Force: Black targets



(30) Police Force: White targets



(30) Black-led protest



in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)

□ ...from top **51 mainstream** [6 UK], and top **18 African American**–oriented, online media sources (Pew, 2015), key word "Ferguson." Aug 9–19, 2014



| Sample. | | | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------|----------------------------|----------|-------------------|-------------------|--|----------------------------|----------------|-------------------|------------------|
| Source | Category | Articles | External Links | Internal Links | Source | Category | Articles | External Links | Interna Links |
| ABC | Top overall | 36 | 21 | 135 | NI | Top overall | 2 | T | 3 |
| AL | Top overall | 40 | 55 | 47 | NPR | Top overall | 71 | 132 | 57 |
| BBC | Top overall | 49 | 49 | 9 | NYDailyNews | Top overall | 54 | 27 | 9 |
| BET | Top African | 26 | 80 | 85 | NYPost | Top overall | 47 | 14 | 41 |
| BlackAmericaWeb | American Top African | 22 | 19 | 7 | NYTimes | Top overall | 80 | 292 | 192 |
| DiackAmericavveb | American | 22 | 17 | | | | 74 | 402 | |
| BlackEnterprise | Top African | 10 | 24 | 25 | Salon | Top overall | 5 | | 34 |
| | American | | | | SFGate | Top overall | | 0 | 6 |
| BleacherReport | Top overall | 2 | 4 | 0 | Slate | Top overall | 41 | 175 | 39 |
| Bossip | Top African | 40 | 29 | 59 | TechCrunch | Top overall | 2 | 14 | 2 |
| | American | | | | Telegraph | Top overall | 43 | 9 | 20 |
| Boston | Top overall | 10 | 19 | 13 | TheAtlantic | Top overall | 27 | 164 | 20 |
| Boston Globe | Top overall | 14 | 0 | 0 | TheBlaze | Top overall | 73 | 111 | 79 |
| BusinessInsider | Top overall | 83 | 247 | 146 | TheRoot | Top African | 58 | 221 | 50 |
| Buzzfeed | Top overall | 45 | 57 | 52 423 | martoot | American | | | |
| CBS ChicagoTribune | Top overall Top overall | 44 | 28 | 423 | Time | Top overall | 92 | 244 | 132 |
| Chron | Top overall | 31 | 76 | 50 | | | 8 | 19 | 0 |
| ClutchMag | Top African | 11 | 24 | 0 | Upworthy | Top overall | | | |
| | American | | | - | USAToday | Top overall | 155 | 227 | 153 |
| CNET | Top overall | 7 | 19 | 14 | USNews | Top overall | 30 | 128 | 26 |
| CNN | Top overall | 89 | 120 | 119 | Vice | Top overall | 33 | 195 | 65 |
| DailyBeast | Top overall | 51 | 60 | 19 | Vox | Top overall | 44 | 117 | 129 |
| DailyMail | Top overall | 161 | 105 | 0 | WashingtonPost | Top overall | 269 | 1045 | 749 |
| DallasMorningNews | Top overall | 28 | 11 | 6 | Yahoo | Top overall | 111 | 281 | 36 |
| DetroitFreePress | Top overall | 34 | 12 | 10 | YBE | Top African | 7 | 26 | 8 |
| Ebony | Top African American | 18 | 196 | 3 | 1.51 | American | | 20 | 0 |
| EliteDaily | Top overall | 3 | 23 | 6 | Total | American | 3,284 | 8,289 | 5,227 |
| Engadget | Top overall | 3 | 23 | 0 | TOtal | | 3,204 | 0,207 | 5,227 |
| Essence | Top African | 12 | 19 | 2 | Note. Number of arti | des and total count | of external by | orlinks (lin | king to ar |
| | American | | | | article from a different | | | | |
| EurWeb | Top African American | 43 | 36 | 30 | the same source) emb sample ($n = 52$ top over | edded in articles of 6 | 6 online news | media sour | ces in fina |
| Examiner | Top overall | 68 | 255 | 189 | sample ($n = 52$ top ove | rall outlets; $n = 14$ top | African Ameri | can-oriente | a outlets) |
| FoxNews | Top overall | 95 | 48 | 24 | | | | | |
| Gawker | Top overall | 61 | 227 | 83 | | | | | |
| Grio | Top African | 18 | 34 | 33 | | | | | |
| | American | | | | | | | | |
| Guardian | Top overall | 89 | 386 | 621 | | | | | |
| HelloBeautiful | Top African American | 9 | 97 | 25 | | | | | |
| HuffPost | Top overall | 240 | 1208 | 439 | | | | | |
| Independent | Top overall | 42 | 24 | 32 | | | | | |
| LATimes | Top overall | 103 | 75 | 177 | | | | | |
| MadameNoire | Top African | 18 | 56 | 10 | | | | | |
| Mashable | American Top overall | 42 | 199 | 57 | | | | | |
| Mic | Top overall | 23 | 201 | 34 | | | | | |
| Mirror | Top overall | 14 | 201 | 23 | | | | | |
| Mlive | Top overall | 9 | 7 | 6 | | | | | |
| MSN | Top overall | 3 | Ó | õ | | | | | |
| NBC | Top overall | 108 | 97 | 279 | | | | | |
| NewsOne | Top African | 35 | 74 | 11 | | | | | |
| | American | | | | | | | | |

Riddle, T. A., Turetsky, K. M., Bottesini, J., Leach, C.W. (2020). "What's Going On" in Ferguson? Online News Frames of Protest at the Police Killing of Michael Brown. Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 23, 882-901.

in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles/headlines, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)

Modeled probabilities using the median and 95% highest density intervals from the posterior distribution.









Riddle, T. A., Turetsky, K. M., Bottesini, J., Leach, C.W. (2020). "What's Going On" in Ferguson? Online News Frames of Protest at the Police Killing of Michael Brown. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations, 23,* 882-901.

in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles/headlines, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)

Probability of images or text including a given concept

(points represent the median of the posterior distribution, and bands represent 95% highest density intervals)



Riddle, T. A., Turetsky, K. M., Bottesini, J., Leach, C.W. (2020). "What's Going On" in Ferguson? Online News Frames of Protest at the Police Killing of Michael Brown. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*, 23, 882-901.

in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles/headlines, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)

□ Probability of images or text including a given concept

(points represent the median of the posterior distribution, and bands represent 95% highest density intervals)

0.6 Probability 0.4 0.2 4 0.0 Michael Brown Aggregated Explanations Michael Brown Active Death Neutral Death Unarmed Youth Race captions the addines images

Riddle, T. A., Turetsky, K. M., Bottesini, J., Leach, C.W. (2020). "What's Going On" in Ferguson? Online News Frames of Protest at the Police Killing of Michael Brown. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*, 23, 882-901.

-African-American - General-public

in Ferguson, MO (3 weeks; 12,589,097 tweets; 1,734,541 users)



Twitter on Aug 2014 shooting of Michael Brown in Ferguson, MO (3 weeks; 12,589,097 tweets; 1,734,541 users)





Correlations of Hashtag Usage (hourly timescale)



□ Time-varying statistics for cumulatively aggregated networks, Aug 1-21

- (a) Number of unique users,
- (b) Number of users connected by similar self-descriptors in their Twitter bio,
- (c) Connectivity measures from Python's Network X: modularity, degree assortativity, network density.



Leach, C.W., Ferguson, S., & Teixeira, C.P. (in press). Protest now: A systems view of 21st century movements. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations.*

Community structure of subgrouping in networks, aggregated



Leach, C.W., Ferguson, S., & Teixeira, C.P. (in press). Protest now: A systems view of 21st century movements. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations*.

Community structure of subgrouping in networks, aggregated



Leach, C.W., Ferguson, S., & Teixeira, C.P. (in press). Protest now: A systems view of 21st century movements. *Group Processes & Intergroup Relations.*

Implications

Necessity of "Trans-Disciplinarity"

- Systems of cognition, emotion, motivation
 - ... situated within socio-ecological systems (e.g., news/social media, groups, institutions)

Deep Dissensus is a...

Deep Challenge to consensus-based/universalistic notions of truth,

Morality/ethics, Justice, Democracy.



Two people argue during a protest of the shooting death of Michael Brown outside Ferguson Police Department headquarters on Aug. 11, 2014, in Ferguson, Missouri

Leach, C.W. & Teixeira, C.P. (2022). Understanding Sentiment Toward "Black Lives Matter". Social Issues and Policy Review, 16 (1), 3-32.
Leach, C.W. (2002). Democracy's dilemma: Explaining racial inequality in egalitarian societies. Sociological Forum, 17, 681-696.
Leach, C.W., Bilali, R., Pagliaro, S. (2015). Groups and Morality. In M. Mikulincer, P.R. Shaver, J.F. Dovidio & J. Simpson (Eds.) APA Handbook of Personality and Social Psychology, Vol. 2: Group Processes (pp.123-149). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association



Multiple Systems of Cognition-Emotion Situated in Societal Systems



Bou Zeineddine, F. & Leach, C.W. (2021). Feeling and Thought in Collective Action on Social Issues: Toward a Systems Perspective. Social & Personality Psychology Compass, 15(7), 1-18.

Leach, C.W. & Bou Zeineddine, F. (2021). A Systems View of Emotion in Socio-political Context. Affective Science, 2, 353-362.





Vote share

Republican

50% 75% 100%

Democrat

100% 75% 50%



neauta

Reset Zoon

https://acleddata.com/us-crisis-monitor/#map

Twitter Corpus of the #BlackLivesMatter Movement and Counter Protests: 2013 to 2021

Salvatore Giorgi,^{1,2} Sharath Chandra Guntuku,² McKenzie Himelein-Wachowiak,¹ Amy Kwarteng,¹ Sy Hwang,² Muhammad Rahman,¹ Brenda Curtis¹



Figure 2: Distribution of *BlackLivesMatter* tweets across the United States for three 3-year periods: 2013 to 2015, 2016 to 2018, and 2019 to 2021. Tweets are mapped to U.S. counties from latitude/longitude coordinates or self-reported user location. Counties grouped into 9 quantiles: darker shades indicate higher tweet density, lighter shades indicate lower tweet density, and grey areas contain no tweet data.

Twitter Corpus of the #BlackLivesMatter Movement and Counter Protests: 2013 to 2021

Salvatore Giorgi,^{1,2} Sharath Chandra Guntuku,² McKenzie Himelein-Wachowiak,¹ Amy Kwarteng,¹ Sy Hwang,² Muhammad Rahman,¹ Brenda Curtis¹



Figure 1: Seven day moving average of monthly tweet count from 2013 to 2021 of all three keywords. We include annotations for high profile events associated with the BLM movement.

"Black Lives Matter protests shift public discourse"

Zackary Okun Dunivina,b,1, Harry Yaojun Yanb,c , Jelani Inced , and Fabio Rojasa



Fig. 6. Weekly hashtag volume for #BlackLivesMatter and three opposing terms. Major and minor protest events are indicated by red and gray dashed lines, respectively.

in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)



Figure 2. The subnetwork of 64 sources for which political leaning data were available, colored by proportion of conservative users from red (highest proportion of conservative users) to blue (lowest proportion of conservative users). Internal hyperlinks (an article linking to another article from the same source) are not pictured, nor are hyperlinks from or to sources outside the 64-source subset.

Turetsky, K. M. & Riddle, T. A. (2018). Porous chambers, echoes of valence and stereotypes: A network analysis of online news coverage interconnectedness following a nationally polarizing race-related event. *Social Psychological and Personality Science*. 9, 163-175.

Online news coverage of the 2014 killing of Michael Brown in Ferguson, MO (10 days: 3,284 articles, 5,490 featured images, 66 sources)



Turetsky, K. M. & Riddle, T. A. (2018). Porous chambers, echoes of valence and stereotypes: A network analysis of online news coverage interconnectedness following a nationally polarizing race-related event. *Social Psychological and Personality Science*. 9, 163-175.

"Beyond the Hashtags" dataset (June 1, 2014 and May 31, 2015) 40.8 million tweets; 4.43 million users

Used 45 keywords (e.g., Ferguson) for content RE: Black Lives Matter and police killings of Black people under questionable circumstances (e.g., Eric Garner, 7/17/14; John Crawford, 8/5/14; Tyree Woodson, 8/5/14; Mike Brown 8/9/14; Ezell Ford, 8/11/14; Dante Parker, 8/12/14; Kakieme Powell, 8/19/14).

| KEYWORD(S) | DATE KILLED | LOCATION | NUMBER OF TWEETS |
|---|---------------|----------------------|------------------|
| #ferguson | N/A | N/A | 21,626,901 |
| "michael brown"/"mike brown"/ #michaelbrown/#mikebrown | Aug 9, 2014 | Ferguson, MO | 9,360,239 |
| #blacklivesmatter | N/A | N/A | 4,312,599 |
| "eric garner"/#ericgarner | July 17, 2014 | Staten Island, NY | 4,286,350 |
| "freddie gray"/#freddiegray | Apr 19, 2015 | Baltimore, MD | 2,559,310 |
| "walter scott"/#walterscott | May 4, 2015 | North Charleston, SC | 1,083,31 |
| "tamir rice"/#tamirrice | Nov 22, 2014 | Cleveland, OH | 1,001,97 |
| "black lives matter" | N/A | N/A | 445,51 |
| "john crawford"/#johncrawford | Aug 5, 2014 | Beavercreek, OH | 331,79 |
| "tony robinson"/#tonyrobinson | Mar 6, 2015 | Madison, WI | 245,02 |
| "eric harris"/#ericharris | Apr 2, 2015 | Tulsa, OK | 200,64 |
| "ezell ford"/#ezellford | Aug 11, 2014 | Los Angeles, CA | 184,14 |
| "akai gurley"/#akaigurley | Nov 20, 2014 | Brooklyn, NY | 150,96 |
| "kajieme powell"/#kajiemepowell | Aug 19, 2014 | St. Louis, MO | 102,52 |
| "tanisha anderson"/#tanishaanderson | Nov 13, 2014 | Cleveland, OH | 27,13 |
| "victor white"/#victorwhite | Mar 3, 2014 | New Iberia, LA | 27,04 |
| "jordan baker"/#jordanbaker | Jan 16, 2014 | Houston, TX | 21,56 |
| "jerame reid"/#jeramereid | Dec 30, 2014 | Bridgeton, NJ | 14,65 |
| "yvette smith"/#yvettesmith | Feb 16, 2014 | Bastrop County, TX | 13,26 |
| "phillip white"/#philipwhite | Mar 31, 2015 | Vineland, NJ | 6,75 |
| "dante parker"/#danteparker | Aug 12, 2014 | Victorville, CA | 5,713 |
| "mckenzie cochran"/#mckenziecochran | Jan 28, 2014 | Southfield, MI | 1,93. |
| "tyree woodson"/#tyreewoodson | Aug 5, 2014 | Baltimore, MD | 1,91- |



Twitter Network, Aug - Nov 2014





Figure 10: Social network diagram for period 4 (Sep 1 – Nov 23)



| ANONYMOUS + VICE | BLACK CELEBRITIES | CONSERVATIVES | INTL SOLIDARITY | (MOSTLY) WHITE LEFT |
|---|--|--|---|---|
| @youranonnews (74238) | @talibkweli (16630) | @barackobama (32225) | @fergusonunity (43859) | @ryanjreilly (75953) |
| @alicesperi (18708) | @common (6057) | @foxnews (16377) | @newsweek (16730) | @wesleylowery (50379) |
| @vicenews (16565) | @rickyrozay (3439) | @youtube (13275) | @bbcworld (13575) | @nytimes (42369) |
| @140elect (14251) | @nelly_mo (3336) | @abc (12983) | @cassfm (12987) | @pdpj (34718) |
| @crypt0nymous (13071) | @joinus (3289) | @thereval (10615) | @rt_com (12063) | @chrislhayes (34181) |
| | | | | |
| MAINSTREAM NEWS | MAINSTREAM NEWS + BLK | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 1 | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 2 | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 3 |
| MAINSTREAM NEWS @the_blackness48 (15373) | | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 1 @nettaaaaaaaaa (27010) | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 2 @antoniofrench (122424) | MULTIRACIAL LEFT 3 @jackfrombkln (40964) |
| | BLK | | | |
| @the_blackness48 (15373) | BLK @cnn (64970) | @nettaaaaaaaa (27010) | @antoniofrench (122424) | @jackfrombkln (40964) |
| @the_blackness48 (15373) @time (15200) | BLK @cnn (64970) @cnnbrk (22247) | @nettaaaaaaaa (27010) @msnbc (26916) | @antoniofrench (122424) @shaunking (61264) | @jackfrombkln (40964) @Natedrug (21251) |

| ANONYMOUS | BLACK ENTERTAINMENT + YBT | BLM | CONSERVATIVES | ENTERTAINERS |
|---|--|---|---|---------------------------------|
| @youranonnews (19344) | @voice (10195) | @deray (54067) | @msnbc (8473) | @youtube (5311) |
| @occupythemob (7485) | @complexmag (8967) | @shaunking (48323) | @chris_1791 (7283) | @therealmikeepps (682) |
| @bipartisanism (5996) | @bet (6218) | @theanonmessage (20253) | @waynedupreeshow (6008) | @disetv (506) |
| @youranonglobal (5414) | @freetopher (4190) | @nettaaaaaaaa (18560) | @gatewaypundit (5090) | @t_h_e_f_a_c_e (486) |
| @breenewsome (5268) | @unclerush (2920) | @michaelskolnik (15175) | @foxnews (4975) | @worldstar (314) |
| | | | | |
| FERGUSON ACTIVISTS + MUCKRAKERS | FERGUSON LOCAL MEDIA + BLACK MEDIA | FERGUSON LOCALS + JOURNALISTS | LIBERAL HUMORISTS + RAPPERS | MAINSTREAM NEWS |
| | | | | MAINSTREAM NEWS @cnn (18331) |
| MUCKRAKERS | MEDIA + BLACK MEDIA | JOURNALISTS | RAPPERS | |
| MUCKRAKERS @bassem_masri (13572) | MEDIA + BLACK MEDIA @kodacohen (8436) | JOURNALISTS @antoniofrench (18372) | RAPPERS @thedailyedge (7794) | @cnn (18331) |
| MUCKRAKERS @bassem_masri (13572) @ryanjreilly (10811) | MEDIA + BLACK MEDIA @kodacohen (8436) @cheathamkmov (7036) | JOURNALISTS @antoniofrench (18372) @sarahkendzior (10615) | RAPPERS @thedailyedge (7794) @talibkweli (6249) | @cnn (18331) @cnnbrk (6306) |